Kloppers, Elsabé
University of South Africa

*People of God? Singing the Psalms as a reflection of identity – Perspectives from South Africa and Scotland*

**ABSTRACT**

The hymns of churches could be the expression of the religious identities of churches, but they could also be symbols of cultural and national identities. In this article the singing of the psalms within certain Reformed churches in South Africa and in Scotland is addressed and related to each other with regard to issues of identity. An effort is made to bring to the fore underlying and often unrecognised cultural and nationalist influences, unacknowledged biases, and structures of power maintaining these symbols.

1. INTRODUCTION

According to the concept of ‘lived religion’, *gelebte Religion* (Dinter, Heimbrock, Söderblom 2007) the religiosity of individuals and groups now comes into sharper focus within the contexts of ‘life-worlds’, suggesting more attention to everyday life, perception, the senses, the body, and to biography and personal experience within the theological discussion. Invited to present a plenary paper at the 75th Anniversary Conference of the Hymn Society of Great Britain and Ireland (HSGBi) in July 2011, I decided to continue a narrative on national identity and the singing of hymns and psalms in the Afrikaans speaking Reformed Churches, presented in a plenary paper at the Biennial Conference of the *Internationale Arbeitsgemeinschaft für Hymnologie* (IAH) in Slovenia in 2001 (Kloppers in Kück and Kurzke 2003). Aspects of the first narrative could be related to experiences I had in singing the psalms in the Church of Scotland during 2010 and 2011. This article, presented from my own perspective of ‘lived religion’ and related to the experiences of ‘lived religion’ of other scholars in the field, is a slight re-working of the conference paper.

2. CHILDHOOD MEMORIES

My parents bought a piano when I was five. One of the first things I tried to play was Psalm 130, *Uit dieptes gans verlore van redding ver vandaan – waar hoop se laaste spore in wanhoop my vergaan* … Together with other psalms, this psalm was already entrenched in my memory when I was five: *Out of the depths I cry, o Lord. Help is far from me. I have lost hope. In the darkest of nights I call on you. Lord, hear my call…*

Why would a child of five love a psalm with such a sombre text? It was the melancholic folk tune to which it was sung that appealed to me. It was sung very slowly and very intensely, with each word accentuated. It was the emotions brought about by the psalm, but also about feeling part of a community: A child of five, being accepted by, being part of, and being at home in the community of believers. I was one of the believers and one with the believers, enclosed by the steadfast men in their church suits, hemmed in by the aunties with their hats – I with my wee hat with the frilled lace, passionately singing with them…

It was, however, not only about being part of the community of believers. It was also about
being part of a cultural group, part of the Afrikaans speaking community; not only about sharing
the faith, but a collective history — a history of suffering, a history of pioneers and of an oppressed
nation. What was the story of my history with which I grew up? I was a descendant of the French
Huguenots, faithful people who fled from France 300 years ago because they were persecuted
and who became one with the Dutch people in the Cape of Good Hope. A new nation, but then
an oppressed people who had to flee because of British imperialism and the invasion of the
Cape in the 19th century; brave people who set out on the Groot Trek (Great Trek) and moved
northwards into wild and unknown country; pioneers leaving behind their farms and putting
their lives to the mercy of ox wagons which could plunge from the mountains; ‘well-meaning
people’ who encountered ‘hostile people’ inland who would fight against them, or would come
to murder them at night... These certainly were people who knew what it was to put their trust
in God. So they sang: “O God van Jacob, deur U hand, word heel u volk gevoed...” O God of Jacob,
by your hand your people are fed. From long ago, on sea (coming from Europe) and land, you
have protected our fathers..."¹

The psalms, especially, gave assurance and were sung with much fervour: Die Heer sal opstaan
tot die stryd... The Lord will stand up to the struggle (Psalm 68, sung to the Genevan/ Strassburg
tune from the 16th century). They saw themselves as making an exodus out of the land of the
(British) oppressors and they drew a parallel between themselves and Israel making the exodus
out of Egypt. As the psalms were the songs of the persecuted and oppressed people of Israel,
singing the psalms was almost axiomatic. References to Zion, Judah and Jerusalem, and imagery
of God’s judgement over the heathen nations were applied directly, as if there was no difference
between the time and situation of the psalms, and the time and situation of the people then
singing them. Metrical psalmody was a defining part of their religious and cultural identity.

Coming to a wide and ‘open’ country, these people at last felt free from British rule. But gold
was discovered in the Transvaal – and Britain struck again. Huge numbers of British troops were
sent to the Transvaal. While the Boers were trying to fend them off in the veld, British troops
swep the countryside and, adhering to a ‘scorched earth’ policy, systematically destroyed crops,
poisoned wells, and burnt down farms and homesteads, some with antique family furniture and
pianos in them. They interned women and children in concentration camps where 26 000 died in
the worst of circumstances. I remember my grandfather, a sincere old man, crying – not able to
tell what the troops did to his mother and sister, before they burnt down their farm.

It made a deep impression on me, hearing theses stories, so to speak, first hand.² So, when
singing Out of the depths as a child, I was one of, and one with an oppressed people – ever
struggling to get out of the depths, ever trying to get over our history, ever being threatened by
new dangers, of which not the least was living as such a small minority of white people among
such a majority of black people. But the Lord would protect us as he had protected our fathers.
The Lord would defend us in the struggle... The psalms told us so.

3. A SHARED IDENTITY AND MYSTERIOUS LEVELS OF SOLIDARITY

At the Annual Conference of the Hymn Society of Great Britain and Ireland in 2006, the Archbishop

¹ Sung to the Scottish tune FRENCH or DUNDEE.
² In Memory, History, Forgetting (2006) Paul Ricoeur examines the reciprocal relationship between
remembering and forgetting, showing how it affects both the perception of historical experience and
the production of historical narrative, stating that it can be asked whether it is possible that history
‘overly remembers’ some events at the expense of others? It can be asked why major historical events
such as the Holocaust occupy the forefront of the collective consciousness, while others such as the
Armenian genocide, the McCarthy era, and France’s role in North Africa stand distantly behind?
Many people haven’t even heard about the concentration camps of the Anglo-Boer war. Over time the
Afrikaans-speaking people were also distinctly told not to get stuck in the past, but ‘to forget’.

Singing the psalms as a reflection of identity 161
of Canterbury, Rowan Williams, an honorary member of the Society, said the following:

Singing is about ... reinforcing a shared identity more and more fully ... We are acknowledging the bonds, and we are recreating or reinforcing the bonds between us that are not just a matter of flat, verbal description or encouragement ... [It is] the assemblage of bone and fat which is meaningful, which makes meanings and which communicates (Williams 2006:108).

We are dealing with some quite mysterious and not very easily accessible levels of solidarity. [When singing] We are saying something about bodies, about the integrity of spirit and body. We are saying something about unity ... something about unity as belonging too with that physical ‘being together’, testing out the tensions, resolving some of the discords, moving together into a pluriform, many layered, common action, which is what worship is (Williams 2006:114).

... the corporate musical expression of God’s people is a way of saying we are confident in who we are. We know that this is our imaginative territory. This is where we place our bodies together, and we show our bodily togetherness that is singing (Williams 2006:111).

‘Bodily togetherness’, the placing together of our bodies, is indeed what forms an essential part of my memories of hymn singing and singing the psalms: Being hemmed in by the women, enclosed by the men, standing among them, feeling accepted, and being at home in the community of believers. I remembered things such as the clothing – the suits of the men, the hats of the women, my own hat; the passion with which I sang, with which WE sang – experiencing togetherness; the integrity of spirit and body; the corporate musical expression of God’s people; the assemblage of bone and fat; the making of meanings; the mysterious levels of solidarity; the reinforcing of the bonds; the feeling of a shared identity.

Donald Webster (1983:20-21) argues that the process of maturing of musical and theological tastes and preferences often begins much earlier in life than is generally recognised. A former Moderator of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, Dr Finlay Macdonald, portrays with nostalgia how he learned many psalm tunes from his Hebridean grandmother who would spend hours at the treadle sewing machine, which shared a room with the piano:

Formal practise of scales and Clementi over, I became a holy juke-box. Granny would call out her favourite psalm tunes and I would duly oblige with renditions of ‘Dunfermline’, ‘Huddersfield’, ‘Martyrs’ and many more. ... Forty years earlier she had been a strong supporter of the suffragette movement and now had a new cause. Between the psalm tunes she would wax eloquent on the iniquities of the Church’s policy of barring women from the ministry and the eldership, and remind her teenage grandson that ‘Women were the first apostles of the resurrection.’ Still today I think of the psalm tunes by name and number, as they appeared in the old split-page Psalter – ‘Kilmarnock 75’, ‘French 61’, ‘Stroudwater 134’

Rowan Williams describes the act of worship and the act of singing together as expression of being God’s people, as a way of saying we know who we are. But he also calls it our imaginative territory.

When we experience our life stories, our identities as people of God, and our identities as part of a specific nation, we might indeed find ourselves more in imaginative territory than
Singing the psalms as a reflection of identity

I gave an overview of the history of my people as I have heard it as a child, have experienced it, and have integrated it – calling it the ‘story’ of my history, and in so doing recognising the inescapability of being in imaginative territory. I have tried to show the link between my religious identity and my cultural identity, and the important part the singing of the psalms played in simultaneously forming my religious, as well as my cultural identity. The singing of the psalms (and other hymns) contributed to my sense of belonging – belonging not only to the community of faith, but also to the community of the Afrikaans-speaking people.

The psalms I refer to were metrical versions derived from the Dutch Calvinist tradition. As the tradition required, all 150 of the Biblical psalms were set to metre. And as the tradition required, every text had to be as near as possible to the original Hebrew – in content, in form and in length. Only about thirty of these metrical psalms were sung. Some were sung because of the tunes. Some were sung for religious reasons. And some were certainly sung for cultural and political reasons, although it was not recognised as such.

The publishing of the psalms in Afrikaans in 1937 was a cultural and political landmark in the history of the Afrikaans people – as was the first Bible in Afrikaans a few years earlier in 1933, and the first full Afrikaans hymnal in 1944. An elderly woman once told me how a cairn was built at an inaugural ceremony for the first Afrikaans Hymnal. They were all dressed in the clothes of the Voortrekkers – representing the time of the Great Trek when people made an exodus from the land of their oppressors. The new hymnal and the full Psalter in Afrikaans was a sign of an own, independent identity.

As a child I sang the psalms with much sincerity, believing that God was indeed listening to our passionate outpourings, indeed believing that we were singing only as expression of being God’s people (in Rowan Williams’ words), and saying we know who we are ‘as God’s people’, and indeed believing that we were singing for religious reasons only. When I became a member of the Committee for a new versification of the psalms into Afrikaans, I came to realise how many reasons there are for singing the psalms, for versifying the psalms, for deciding on the policies for versifying, appointing the members for committees, choosing the poet(s) – not to mention the publishers. And I realised how often these reasons were very non-religious.

If I had thought that singing psalms and hymns was free of ideology, only promoting unity, acceptance, the ‘sharing and strengthening of bonds’ and our identity ‘as the people of God’, I then became aware of church politics, personal politics, processes of canonisation and legitimation, positions of power that wouldn’t be questioned; traditionalist, nationalist, fundamentalist, sectarian views – in short, all powers of identity that could come into play. I learnt that the easiest answer was: ‘According to the old (Afrikaans) Dutch Reformed tradition...’ Which meant: Don’t question, don’t ask, don’t criticise – and don’t even think of alternatives. Full stop.

4. A NEW VERSIFICATION OF THE METRICAL PSALMS IN AFRIKAANS

At the Psalm Committee the main principle was that the full text of each psalm simply had to be ‘reproduced’ in its entirety into Afrikaans verse. All psalms had to be in the same metrical form and it would not be called a ‘psalm’ if a metaphor or image was amiss. Deviating from the text would mean deviating from ‘the tradition.’ Another requirement was ‘singable’ tunes for the newly versified psalms. Some people were dissatisfied that the full corpus of Genevan tunes would not be not retained: For them keeping the Genevan tunes as a whole would strengthen the signs of the Calvinist Reformed identity, marking a long tradition in which this identity has been formed.

If one of the prime requirements for a new versification was ‘attractive and easy’ tunes,
one could ask: How does one sing an imprecatory psalm to a suitable tune, not to speak of an attractive and easy tune? What I really want to argue is this: If so much of our religious and cultural identity is formed by what we sing, what kind of identity would I have had, had I really sung the imprecatory psalms from my childhood? After the concentration camps of the Anglo Boer war, I would have sung with my people to the British and their people: ‘Happy is the one who seizes your infants and dashes them against the rocks’ (Psalm 137).

It is true that we must be able to voice the full range of our emotions and that the psalms are a vehicle for it. As John Bell says in his Introduction to *Psalms of Patience, Protest and Praise* (1993): The psalms ‘cover in theme and expression, the whole gamut of human experience. Exuberance, delight and unbridled joy are there. So also are questioning, curiosity and impatience. So also are agony, loneliness, and deep despair.’ He speaks about ‘complaining to Heaven when no-one on earth seems interested’ (back cover). It is one thing, however, to sing songs of lament, complaining to God, questioning God, struggling with God, voicing one’s protest – but another to collectively sing imprecatory psalms directed to someone else or against the people of a nation, however much one might feel injured, individually or collectively. As a child I already learnt that we should beg for mercy, confessing our wrongdoings, praying that God would change the hearts of the perpetrators – as well as ours...

I grew up with these principles – even if I was part of the history of my people and even if I had sung the psalms as a part of my people – which made it clear to me that some sections of the Psalter are unsuitable to be sung in Christian worship (see Kloppers 2000, 2002a and Patrick 1949:227). This view differed from the views held by many members of the Psalm Committee, who argued that there were and are times that these psalms are needed in the life of a ‘volk’. Theological arguments were often met with answers regarding our cultural tradition, which made me realise that there was more to it than meets the eye (see also Kloppers 2002b).

A rigid view of ‘the tradition’ and what would be needed by ‘the people’ squashed hopes for a wider view on the psalms which would also provide for more variety such as chant, psalms from Iona, Taizé, etc. In trying to open up new possibilities I hoped to get away from an old and rigid Afrikaans Calvinist Dutch Reformed identity and to expand our identity to a richer, more encompassing ecumenical identity as people of God.

5. THE SCOTTISH TRADITION OF METRICAL PSALMS

There seems to be many similarities between the situation in the Afrikaans Dutch Reformed Churches and that of the Church of Scotland. Steeped in the legacy of Calvin, the tradition of metrical psalms in these churches played a vital role in contributing to the forming of a cultural, and probably also political, identity. Soon after I came to Scotland my colleague told me that I should have at least one metrical psalm in every service. As if there was no experience with a Committee for Psalms, I simply asked: “Why?” The answer was simple: “Singing the psalms is important to the people in Scotland and it is a tradition that should be honoured.” Full stop. Again.

When in Scotland... you sing the psalms. There were times that I felt forced to leave out a good hymn that would go very well with my sermon and the rest of the service. The dynamics and feel of contextual relevancy that I worked to bring about were sometimes dampened by an archaic sounding psalm text. It reminded me of Canon Alan Luff (1992) saying that we, by singing the psalms in our present culture (as opposed to becoming aware of them through reading, meditation, etc.), may actually be distancing ourselves from their ethical and social appeal.

John Bell from the Iona Community, well-known hymnologist, hymn writer and convener of the Committee for Church Hymnary 4 (CH4) laments the rigid power of *the tradition* which
demands to be obeyed without reflection or critique:

As a child, the psalm was always the first singing in our congregation, for no other reason than that was what we had always done. The use of a psalm of lament or regret in association with the prayers of confession or intercession would have been unheard of. The totem had to be venerated in the opening song, and then we might sing texts which were more appropriate to the season, lectionary or reason for gathering. ... My own perspective is that the priority of the psalms and the disdain of ‘human’ texts until the late 19th century were, to some extent, sectarian. It proved that Protestants were not Catholics. The metrical psalms were a kind of badge of identity (my emphasis). What they did not do was to provide the church with much of a Christology. And I wonder whether my denomination would have been less legalistic if it had supplemented its psalmody with something of a more Christ centric nature. (Email dated the 1st of July 2011)

I met a few people in the congregation in Scotland who loved the metrical psalms, but were opposed to the idea of responsorial forms, complaining that they were ‘Roman Catholic’ or ‘Anglican’. They were also opposed to the cross as a symbol in the church, and the use of candles. Maybe this shows indeed that metrical psalms were/are in the sphere of things used ‘to prove that Protestants were not Catholics’ and that they could serve as a kind of ‘badge of identity’ as Bell describes it. This corresponds with the view of Professor Dick Watson, who argues that the psalms were indeed what distinguished Reformed worship from the worship of the Roman Catholic Church:

At the Reformation itself, the psalms were seen to be of particular importance, not only as individual expressions of religious experience, or as divinely inspired, or as prefigurations of the New Testament, but as clear indicators of the great divide that existed between the children of God and their enemies. The interpretation of the Genevan church as the true successor of the children of Israel is one that is invited by the ‘Argument’ prefaced to the psalms in the Geneva Bible. (Watson 1999:44-45)

In a paper delivered in Halifax in 2003 and published as an Occasional Paper of the HSGBI in December 2011, Dr Graham Deans, a Minister in the Church of Scotland, argues that the metrical Psalter has exercised ‘a mighty influence over the Scottish heart and mind for many generations. But in matters of liturgy, I think that it has to be recognised that, generally speaking, the Scots have not been innovators, but imitators’ (Deans 2011:9). He also shows that metrical Psalmody cannot claim to be a Scottish invention, but that the Scots have appropriated it. The 1650 Psalter has been virtually canonised: ‘It has resisted all attempts at modernisation and revision; and it is as though Scottish creative imagination and genius ceased at that date’ (Deans 2011:18). Elsewhere he describes it even more strongly: ‘It is arguable that the practice of versifying large sections of Scripture – particularly from the Psalter – helped to stifle theological development, to stunt spiritual growth, and to hamper the process of creative imagination’ (Deans 1999:230)

Unfortunately the same can be said of the Afrikaans churches: In liturgical matters we haven’t been innovators. In our hymnody and psalmody we used to be so conservative, our ‘tradition’ so heavily guarded and the processes of creative imagination so hampered, that almost all creativity regarding hymns and psalms was stifled. Church Hymnary 4 (2005) of the Church of Scotland reflects a much broader identity than that of the Afrikaans Psalter of 2001. It includes responsorial psalms, antiphons, psalms for reading, Taize settings, plainsong chant and Anglican Chant. It provides for the variety in the psalms I so wished for in the Afrikaans hymnal.
6. IDENTITY: CULTURAL AND POLITICAL MEMORY

The identity of faith of the individual as well as the identity of the community of faith, do not exist in themselves, but have a history called the collective memory (Assmann 1991:13-30). Identity is about the collective political and cultural memory embedded in a nation’s psyche. A nation’s historical narrative could also reside in music ‘that negotiates the borders between myth and history, thus “memorializing the past”’ (Bohlman 2011:196).

Finlay Macdonald thought it was ‘a nice touch when the Scottish Parliament, at its “reconvening” on 1 July 1999, chose to mark the occasion with the singing of the Old Hundredth – “All people that on earth do dwell, sing to the Lord with cheerful voice”’ (Macdonald 2004:76, see also Being Scottish 2002:159-161). Wouldn’t the singing of a psalm at the opening of the Scottish parliament be an indicator of the psalms functioning as ‘a kind of badge of identity’? Indeed even stronger, seeing that the text was by a Scottish author, William Kethe, and from the Scottish Psalter 1650 – therefore also ‘memorializing the past’. It certainly would be a clear indication of how deeply a certain psalm had come to be embedded in the cultural memory of a nation.

Patrick (1949) argued that the psalms of the Psalter of 1650 are ‘a precious part of the national religious inheritance’ and an ‘incomparable medium of the national Church’s praise’ and that they ‘have been interwoven with our national history for full three hundred years.’ He also lamented the fact that in his time already there were services in which no place was given to one of ‘the national psalms’ (Patrick 1949:227-230). Elsewhere his nationalist feelings sounded even stronger: ‘[i]n the portions that are most suitable for public worship there is a rugged strength, an elevation and dignity, which make those passages incomparable for congregational use. So long as there are Scots folk to sing them, those psalms, so interwoven with their history and interfused (sic) with their very blood, will always hold first place in their national worship-song’ (Patrick [1927] 1947:106).

Not only words of psalms are important. Tunes and styles of performance also play an essential role. In the west of Scotland and especially on the Western Isles, the psalms are performed in a distinct way. The identity of Gaelic speakers is marked by the way they perform the psalms in Gaelic. How strongly tunes came to be embedded in the cultural memory of the Scots can be seen in the poem, The Cotter’s Saturday Night, by Robert Burns (1759 – 1796), where the names of certain beloved psalm tunes are quoted as old acquaintances in the Scots’ mind:

They chant their artless notes, in simple guise,  
They tune their hearts, by far the noblest aim;  
Perhaps Dundee’s wild-warbling measures rise.  
Or plaintive Martyrs, worthy of the name;  
Or noble Elgin beets the heavenward flame,  
The sweetest far of Scotia’s holy lays.  
Compar’d with these, Italian trills are tame...

How deeply the psalms can be embedded in the cultural or political memory of a nation is also apparent from a story told at a service in Glasgow commemorating the 450th Anniversary of the Reformation in Scotland on the 31st of October 2010 (see also the Foreword to Deans 2011) according to which the new Scottish MP’s, on their way to Westminster after a landslide election in 1922, got onto the train, accompanied by the singing of psalms by the people on the platform...

Identity is formed by a sense of self and by things shared with one another, and a strong sense of there being others or strangers from which one needs to distance oneself: ‘Es gibt keine
Identität ohne Alterität, keine Identitätserfahrung ohne “Feindbild”. Starke kollektive Identität entsteht durch starke Alteritäten’ (Kurzke, in Kueck and Kurzke 2003:223). A well-known passage from the Declaration of Arbroath 13203, a declaration of Scottish independence, in the form of a letter to Pope John XXII, asking him to recognise Scotland’s status as an independent, sovereign state, reveals strong anti-English feelings:

...for, as long as but a hundred of us remain alive, never will we on any conditions be brought under English rule. It is in truth, not for glory, nor riches, nor honours that we are fighting, but for freedom – for that alone, which no honest man gives up but with life itself. (From the website of the National Archives of Scotland)

It is a known fact that in the course of history the Scots often felt, and often still feel, that they are not recognised by the English.4 At times they even felt oppressed by the English.5 Wouldn’t it then be ‘natural’ for them to sing the psalms in their churches – if the Psalms ‘after all had been the book of the persecuted church’ (Watson 1999:502)? The psalms came to be a symbol through which their identity could be confirmed and strengthened.

One can easily see the similarities between the Scots feeling oppressed by the English, and the Afrikaans people seeing themselves not only as an oppressed people making an exodus from their British rulers, but later also as a small minority among a big majority of black people. Apart from the theological and liturgical meaning the singing of the psalms in both nations was used as a device to stabilize and protect the collective memory in periods of uncertainty. The psalms have played a role in the formation of the religious and cultural identities of both the Scots and the Afrikaans speaking people, assuring both nations of God’s goodwill for his chosen people and protection from their enemies...

... The wicked and the persecutors of the children of God shall see howe the hand of God is ever against them...

Argument to the psalms in the Geneva Bible (in Watson 1999:45)

7. CONCLUSION

Many of the views discussed in this article may now be outdated and outlived, but the narratives and arguments show that hymns and psalms not only form an essential part of the religious language and self-expression of churches and individual believers, but they form also an important part of the cultural identities and collective cultural memory of a nation. Critical reflection on the use of psalms, hymns and songs is necessary in order to recognise the own biases, underlying motives, and subconscious cultural, political and ideological influences playing a role in the processes of singing hymns and psalms.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Assmann, J 1991. Der zweidimensionale Mensch. Das Fest als Medium des kollektiven Gedächtnisses, in

3 The original copy of the Declaration is lost, but a copy survives among Scotland’s state papers, held by the National Archives of Scotland in Edinburgh.
4 An interesting source, among other, more scholarly ones, is The Scots’ Crisis of Confidence (2011) in which Carol Craig reveals the Scots’ feelings of negativity and constant sense of being the underdog. Things done to the Scots in the course of history are often ‘overly forgotten’
5 Many people are also unaware of things that happened in the history of the Scots – maybe they too are ‘overly forgotten’
Bell, John 2011. Email, dated 1 July 2011.

**KEY WORDS**

psalms
hymns
identity
nationalism
collective cultural memory

**CONTACT DETAILS**

Dr. Elsabé Kloppers
Departement Filosofie, Praktiese- en Sistematiese Teologie UNISA
Tel.: 012 429 6589
E-pos: kloppec@unisa.ac.za

168 Deel 53, NOMMERS 3 & 4, SEPTEMBER/DESEMBER 2012